

## **Thirteenth Meeting**

**19<sup>th</sup> September, 2018, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, Iveagh House**

### **Minutes: Formal Meeting**

---

#### **Attendees:**

##### **Oversight Group**

1. Nora Owen, Independent Chair
2. Representative of Louise Synnott, An Garda Síochána
3. Michael Rowan, Independent Expert
4. Emer O'Brien, Development Co-operation Divisions, DFAT
5. Nura Hagi, Mind the Gap
6. Réiseal Ni Chéilleachair, Concern
7. Noreen Wolfe, Department of Defence
8. Diane Nurse, HSE
9. Laura Leonard, Audit and Evaluation, DFAT
10. Catherine O'Rourke, Transitional Justice Institute, University of Ulster

##### **Secretariat:**

11. Áine Hearn, Conflict Resolution Unit, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade
12. Aoife Lyons, Conflict Resolution Unit, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade
13. William Barrett, Conflict Resolution Unit, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade
14. Claire Dowling, Conflict Resolution Unit, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade

##### **Apologies<sup>1</sup>:**

- Catherine O'Rourke, Transitional Justice Institute, University of Ulster
- Walt Kilroy, School of Law and Governance, Dublin City University
- Sarah McGrath, IUKA
- AnnMarie Quarry, Department of Justice and Equality
- Terence O'Neill, Department of Justice and Equality
- Anastasia Crickley, Department of Applied Social Studies, Maynooth University
- Gillian Collins, Defence Forces
- Cillian O'Kelly, Permanent Representation Ireland to the EU
- Ellen O'Malley Dunlop, National Women's Council of Ireland
- Ruth Taillon, Centre for Crossborder Studies.

---

<sup>1</sup> severe storm weather on the morning disrupted public transport and thus prevented some members from attending

## **1. Adoption of previous meeting's minutes**

In opening the meeting, the Chair welcomed the group back to the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade and summarised the agenda for the day. She also took time to welcome Aoife Lyons, who has just recently filled the vacant Deputy Director position in the Conflict Resolution Unit and Claire Dowling who has taken over from Heidi Riley as the Intern in CRU, focusing on WPS, and who will act as Secretary to this Oversight Group. Prior to the meeting, it was noted that the year on the minutes needed to be amended to 2018 and that Laura Leonard's name needed to be added to the list of those who attended. Approval of the previous minutes was brought before the group and there were no objections.

## **2. Update from the Secretariat:**

### **Regional Acceleration of Resolution 1325 (RAR)**

This event was held in Iveagh House on the 14<sup>th</sup> and 15<sup>th</sup> June and an update was provided at the Twelfth Oversight Group meeting. A report is currently being produced and will be circulated to the Group.

### **The annual Ba'hai Summer School**

Marcella Smyth Deputy Director International Security Policy Section in Political Division presented on WPS and Peacebuilding on behalf of CRU at the annual Ba'hai Summer School in Kilkenny on 10<sup>th</sup> August. Further details will be shared in the Newsletter.

### **CRU and WPS at the UN General Assembly**

The new Deputy Director of CRU, Aoife Lyons, will be attending UNGA next week, attending several high profile WPS related events which Ireland is cosponsoring. Ireland recently joined The Group of Friends of the **African Women's Leader Network (AWLN)**, which was established in June 2017 and they will host an event entitled "A Seat at the Table: Nurturing Young Women Leadership for Transformation" which Aoife Lyons will speak at. As one of the founding donors to the Women's Peace & Humanitarian Fund (WPHF), Ireland will be involved in two events during UNGA. Ireland is the lead sponsor for a WPHF lunch, along with the Global Network of Women Peace builders & UNFPA WPHF. Ireland's Minister of State with special responsibility for Diaspora and International Development, Ciaran Cannon T.D, and Kristen Bell, an actress and WPHF's first Global Advocate, will also speak at the event. The Tánaiste, Simon Coveney, will then speak at a WPHF main evening event, called "Accelerating the Women's Movement for Peace & Humanitarian Action". At this event, which will also be attended by Kristen Bell, the 40 by 20 Campaign which aims to raise \$40m by 2020 for the Fund will be launched and the Tánaiste will announce funding for WPHF. Aoife will also attend a WPS focal point network event following our continued work with them and CRU's attendance at their event in April last. It is organized by the German and Dutch foreign ministers. All of these events are aligned to the Secretariat's aim to raise the profile of WPS, particularly regarding the Security Council Campaign.

### **The Concern 50<sup>th</sup> Anniversary Conference**

At the Concern Conference, attended by the Secretariat from CRU and several other Oversight Group members, three new papers on "Breaking the Cycle" of Conflict were launched. It was noted that Concern had worked with CRU regarding the inclusion of Gender Mainstreaming and WPS throughout the papers. The Secretariat commented on the success of the event, including the openness of the panels, particularly Amina Mohammed, the Deputy Secretary General of the United Nations and Ambassador Fatima Kyari Mohammed, Permanent Observer of the African Union to the UN, who is testimony to why CRU wishes to continue further ties to the African Women's Leader Network.

### **EU Task Force Meeting**

Claire Dowling attended the technical level informal Task Force Meeting on the 14<sup>th</sup> September in Brussels. The EU is currently in the process of developing a Strategic Approach to Resolution 1325 in order to update the 2008 Comprehensive Approach document in order to account for the changes regarding contemporary global challenges, and progress in WPS that has taken place over the last decade.

Member States (MS) were provided with a draft of the new document prior to the meeting in order to make observations and comments. During the workshop member states and the EEAS Secretariat reviewed each section of the document, paragraph by paragraph with each MS given the opportunity to comment on the language used. This enabled discussion on how the document needed to find balance regarding the language being both meaningful and open to interpretation regarding the context of each member state.

A new draft, taking account of the outcomes of the meeting, will be shared with European Peace Liaison Office (EPLO) and it is the hope of the EEAS secretariat to have the document approved by the Commission by the end of the year.

As reported at the last meeting, Ireland is taking a lead on Monitoring and Evaluation. There was follow-up on CRU's consideration of inviting Polish representatives to observe the consultations for NAP 3 at the end of the year and to include Latvia, Greece who have approached CRU and possibly some other MS.

### **An Irish network or consortium of women mediators.**

CRU is still considering the best way forward regarding the development of a Network or Consortium of Women Mediators, particularly finding value that fits into the work of other mediation based networks/ organisations. Heidi Riley (previous CRU Intern) in her new role as Assistant Professor in UCD will travel to Cyprus with Monica McWilliams for an event being funded by DFAT and organised by Ambassador Deirdre Ni Fhalluin for an event on getting local women mediators involved in the peace process. There will be a report for the next OG meeting

## **3. Update from the Consultants for the Final Review of the 2<sup>nd</sup> NAP**

Bronagh Hinds and Debbie Donnelly updated the Secretariat on the findings that have begun to emerge from the interviews being undertaken for the Final Review of the Second NAP (see presentation attached). During the initial interview process (14 at the time of the presentation), it emerged that there have been substantial findings and developments since the midterm review. There are a number of further interviews to be held and it is expected that the first draft of the report is expected to be ready by October. Issues of note which have emerged include the need for a more comprehensive monitoring framework, a loss of institutional memory due to high OG and Secretariat turnover; and an analysis gap which needs to be improved by better collation of information regarding impact. This could be improved by building on the real time performance metrics system (which has been developed by CRU for their business plan) and considering the inclusion of more case studies in the next NAP. It was also expressed that better training and creating a mechanism to simplify WPS would be useful for outreach both within and outside government departments. It was suggested that one way that this could be done is the expansion of the CRU mapping document. The interviews so far have also demonstrated that there has been substantial delivery against commitments and that there is evidence of increased advocacy and effectiveness.

The consultants also praised and expressed the need for further development in the next NAP regarding the relationship of WPS to Northern Ireland, asylum seekers and migrants, and better M & E. It was also suggested and agreed upon by the Oversight Group that the third plan should be in place for a longer period than the current 3 years. Five years was suggested to bring it in line with Irish Aid Country Strategy programmes. Other EU countries with longer NAPs are UK 5 years, Denmark 5 years, Sweden Latest 4 years (previously 3 years), Austria Latest 4 years (previously 5 years), Finland Latest 4 years, Portugal Latest 4 years (previously 5 years) and Australia Latest 6. It is considered that a longer period will allow for the improvement in evaluating progress and a more effective analysis of long term change and impact.

In both the consultants' presentation and the following OG discussion, it was expressed that there needs to be better empowerment for those in government departments and statutory bodies who wish to be more involved and have more scope in the next NAP. This included the Department of Education, the Department of Health and the Department of Community and Rural Affairs. Several OG members also expressed the need for including the Disarmament and Non-Proliferation Unit, DFAT relating it back to the role of the Security Council where there is a need for more accountability and response from countries selling weapons. On this point it was noted that the arms trade affects many elements of WPS. This is important to consider in Ireland's Security Council Campaign, of which WPS already has a key part. It was also suggested that there is a focus, like in Canada and Sweden's NAPs, to promote the approach of the most recent resolution which does not solely characterise women as victims but as agents for change. There were also calls for Ireland to continue its role as a world leader regarding its domestic application of WPS, and the request for the greater inclusion of the concepts of the YPS agenda.

#### **4. Forthcoming Meetings and Events for the OG**

- The visit by the Chair Nora Owen and another OG member to a Direct Provision centre is still in the process of being organised. The Secretariat needs to follow up with Diane Nurse regarding a visit to Baleskin Reception Centre, but it was also suggested that Mosney might be more suitable. Michael Rowan and Nora Owen both expressed a desire to take part in the visit. The Secretariat will follow-up with AnnMarie Quarry on her return to work on the visit before the next OG meeting in December.
- The 5<sup>th</sup> December was suggested as the date of the next OG and the section that is usually covered by a thematic session will be used to cover the report on the final review of NAP 2 and an update on NAP 3.

#### **Upcoming Events**

*Secretariat to the Oversight Group to Ireland's 2<sup>nd</sup> National Action Plan on Women, Peace and Security.*

*24<sup>th</sup> September 2018*

## **Thirteenth Meeting**

**19<sup>th</sup> September 2018, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, Iveagh House**

### **Minutes: Thematic Meeting**

---

#### **Session 1: The Way Forward for the 3rd National Action Plan**

This session focussed on the proposed steps to begin the process for the Third National Action Plan. The Secretariat gave a presentation (attached) on the procedure taken for the Second NAP and how this could be used for the development of NAP 3, including a possible timeline. It was suggested that the NAP 3 Consultation process would be undertaken at the same time as the 2nd NAP Final Review. This parallel process would allow for the NAP 3 to be published in early 2018, while still allowing for the NAP 3 drafting process to incorporate the findings of the NAP 2 Final Review (final draft scheduled for December). In line with the NAP 2 process, it was proposed that: 1) A NAP 3 Working Group be established to oversee this process 2) There will be a call for Public Submissions regarding what should be considered as issues and priorities in the development of the Third NAP, 3) Workshop (s) will be organised to further consider the questions raised in the Public Submissions.

The Secretariat hope that the first step (the establishment of the NAP 3 Working Group) can happen as soon as possible in order to be able to move forward. A draft terms of reference was printed for OG members to consider. Several OG members recommended changes to the TORs (an updated version is attached). There was unanimous agreement that the group be called the NAP 3 working Group (instead of Consultative/Consultation Group as it had been done in NAP 2). This would avoid confusion regarding its distinctions from the Oversight Group. There was confusion regarding the necessity of who needed to approve nominations to the NAP 3 Working Group. Having followed up on the procedure from the Second NAP, it was found by CRU that approval is needed by the Tánaiste regarding the nominations of the members of the group as the decisions made by this group will be reflected in a government policy document (the final NAP 3 document) and for accountability regarding expenditure. This has been reflected in the updated TORs. Réiseal ní Cheallaigh's suggestion to add more about the importance of diversity and inclusion was unanimously supported by the committee and is reflected in the updated TORs and Laura Leonard requested that the timeline be circulated with the TORs.

The Secretariat has requested that all members of the OG comment on and approve the TORs (attached) through silent submission by the 1<sup>st</sup> October. They also asked for all members of the OG to nominate a representative or themselves to sit on the NAP working Group by the 8th October. All nominations should be accompanied by a CV/bio of the individual. They are requested to take into account the time commitment (a monthly meeting) and the importance of diversity, balance, and inclusion and that Government/Statutory Bodies cannot nominate a member from Independent/Civil Society/Academia to represent themselves (or

vice versa). The Secretariat would take responsibility for circulating the TORs, making suggested amendments and cataloguing the list of nominees for approval.

## **Session 2: Countering Violent Extremism and the WPS Agenda**

Nora introduced the theme for the afternoon and introduced the two speakers, Dr Sahla Aroussi, a feminist researcher at the Centre of Trust Peace and Social Relations, University of Coventry and John Boylan, Deputy Director in the International Security Policy Unit of the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT).

### **Women, Peace and Security and Violent Extremism: From International Policy to Local Significance**

Ms Sahla presented her work (PowerPoint attached), entitled “Women, Peace and Security and Violent Extremism: From International Policy to Local Significance”. It focussed on her project, which involves fieldwork in Kenya, Tunisia and New York to study how the integration of the WPS with the CVE is working in policy and practice.

Following UN Resolution 2242 member states were deemed required to pay attention to gender and CVE. At the UN there was a drive regarding the integration of the concepts. Equally at the UN there was a huge restructuring of counter terrorism plan on the prevention of CVE. What has emerged is a lack of consistent definition regarding counter-terrorism (CT) and countering violent extremism (CVE) and preventing violent extremism (PVE). As with CT, CVE often is often over-focused on Islamic Extremism. In Kenya, there have been a number of high profile attacks such as the WestGate Mall attack. Muslim communities have been targeted in Kenya as a result. The National Counter-terrorism Centre which coordinates their strategy answers to the President and their NAP does not include CVE. In Tunisia following the 2011 revolution there has been an increase in attack due to the political climate, particularly the weakening of the state and security forces. However CVE is included in the NAP in Tunisia.

The lack of definition and confusion regarding PVE/CVE creates operational and programmatic problems on the ground and is very difficult to resolve at the UN level. The definition is project based and depends on the context. This poses particular difficulty when different groups across different contexts may have different conceptions regarding who they consider the violent extremist or terrorist. This is particularly prevalent in contexts of gang violence and police brutality.

This relates directly to WPS in a number of ways. For instance if a woman reports that her daughter is missing and she is Muslim, it will be assumed she is a terrorist, which affects the procedure. Another issue is the danger regarding funding as if NGOs declare that their projects are related to CVE then they are vulnerable to extra-judicial killing and other discrimination. However, as there is increased funding on CVE NGOs (including women's based NGOs) are often forced to include it, despite the risk. Sahla recommended the use of policies regarding “Preventing” Violent Extremism rather than “Countering” Violent

Extremism. Equally Sahla recommended that funding for P/CVE should not take away from funding for WPS as has occurred in these two cases.

### **Irish CVE Policy and WPS**

John Boylan gave an overview of the changes regarding the terms radicalization vs terrorism in the department, noting a global change after 9/11/2001. He acknowledged the importance of definition and that from now on he would define the work of Ireland as Preventing Violent Extremism. He defined terrorism as the act and violent extremism as the ideology which underpins that act. Ireland focusses on a number of processes for PVE. These include community debates, intra and inter faith dialogues, training state security, and developing national strategies. He notes that women are involved in the community level but should be more involved in the planning. While Ireland has not been hit by VE aside from the domestic context, it is still considered susceptible to VE. There is therefore a focus on social exclusion/marginalized group. He explained that similar to gender equality, all groups should not be socially excluded. He saw this exclusion as not just being socio economic exclusion exclusively but had a range of social factors. There is also a growing focus on people who return far right extremism, particularly in migration-Neo Nazi. Domestic terrorism, while low risk required continued vigilance needed-education. Regarding preventing Islamic VE Ireland addresses the threats that have emerged as to how it has been used as a base for planning

DFAT has a role in informing national policy through embassies, while the Department of Justice leads on the operational element. Ireland currently has no CVE plan, and needed to engage bilaterally in EU working group, UN and OSCE. In this sense there is a need for a whole-government approach regarding C/PVE which also engaged with the EU and international context. This also required an integrated gender approach that would be both operational and conceptual. It was expressed that WPS and PVE have mutual aims regarding citizenship and human rights and that preventing social exclusion is an important intersection

### **Questions and Comments:**

Following Sahla and John's presentations the floor was opened for questions and comments. Sahla noted that from her research that she saw ideology as playing very little part regarding VE, particularly for those who are uneducated. She noted that in Tunisia that the frustrated hope following the Arab Spring and the fact that there is high unemployment among 18-34 year olds as having contributed to recruiting. Equally it was noted that IS, for instance pay their recruits in US dollars. The approach to PVE should be focused more on drivers than ideology and the different contexts.

There was debate among OG members as to whether or not CVE and WPS were compatible at all. A lot of this conversation focussed on the question of hierarchies. While there was unanimity that WPS was deemed important for P/CVE agenda, there was a question regarding the value of how P/CVE could really contribute to WPS. There were a variety of opinions about how this could be overcome.

There was a call for ensuring funding was prioritized for WPS and that the two agendas not be pledged against each other. This can be overcome somewhat by ensuring that Ireland embrace PVE over the language around CVE and ensuring that WPS embraced and not instrumentalised in PVE.

**AOB:**

Michael Rowen brought the retired members of the defence forces' protest to the attention of the group. Serving members of the Defence Forces cannot strike thus the retired members and their families were highlighting the issue on their behalf – the first time this has happened since the Defence Forces were formed by the State. The protest is a reaction to the loss of personnel and the reenlistment of naval officers and low salaries paid to lower ranking officers. The group were all in agreement that the calls of this protest were deeply important to WPS as Ireland's Peacekeeping Operations are integral to Ireland's credibility and the success of many elements of our NAPs. The Chair suggested that she would bring this to the attention of the Minister for Defence and the Tánaiste, highlighting the importance of the defence forces' work and its importance to the continued capacity of our future NAPs. .

*Secretariat to the Oversight Group to the 2<sup>nd</sup> National Action Plan on Women, Peace and Security*

*24<sup>th</sup> September 2018*